

Members

Kevin Bartoy, Chair
Jennifer Mortensen, Vice-Chair
Jonathan Hart
Sarah Hilsendeger
Alex Morganroth
Lysa Schloesser
Jenny Sullivan
Jeff Williams
George Zeno
Deborah Cade, North Slope Ex-Officio
Leah Jaggars, Wedge Ex-Officio



MINUTES

Landmarks Preservation Commission Planning and Development Services Department

Staff

Reuben McKnight, Historic Preservation Officer
Susan Johnson, Historic Preservation Coordinator
Paige Rooney, Historic Preservation Intern
Mary Crabtree, Administrative Assistant

Date: December 14, 2022

Location: Hybrid – Conference Room 243, 747 Market Street, Tacoma WA 98402 & Zoom Webinar

Commission Members in Attendance:

Kevin Bartoy, Chair
Jennifer Mortensen, Vice-Chair
Sarah Hilsendeger
Alex Morganroth
Lysa Schloesser
George Zeno (arrived at 6:42 p.m.)
Deborah Cade, North Slope Ex-Officio
Leah Jaggars, Wedge Ex-Officio

Commissioner Members Excused:

Jenny Sullivan
Jeff Williams

Commission Members Absent:

Jonathan Hart

Staff Present:

Reuben McKnight
Susan Johnson
Paige Rooney
Mary Crabtree

Others Present:

Spencer Howard
Michael Sullivan
Doug Naini
Ann Sung

Vice-Chair Mortensen called the meeting to order at 5:32 p.m.

1. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF INDIGENOUS LANDS

2. ROLL CALL

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. McKnight reported that two written comments were received regarding 2804 McCarver.

4. CONSENT AGENDA

The agenda was approved as submitted.

A. Excusal of Absences

- Jenny Sullivan
- Jeff Williams

B. Approval of Minutes

There were no minutes for approval.

C. Administrative Review

- 913 N Grant – rear solar panels
- 810 N. Cushman – siding replacement
- 924 N. Grant – window replacement
- 421 N. Sheridan – new construction

- 624 N. M St. – window replacement
- 1105 N Sheridan – window/siding replacement
- 1510 N 9th – garden wall

5. NOMINATIONS TO THE TACOMA REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES

A. 314 N. Yakima Ave

Ms. Rooney read the staff report as provided in the packet.

Chair Bartoy moved that the Landmarks Preservation Commission adopt the analysis as findings and schedule the 314 N. Yakima Avenue nomination for a public hearing and future consideration at a tentative hearing date of January 25, 2023. Commissioner Hilsendeger seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

B. 1117 Pacific (National Realty Building)

Ms. Rooney read the staff report as provided in the packet.

Mr. Howard provided additional information regarding the nomination.

Commissioner Hilsendeger asked about the condition of the exterior of the building.

Chair Bartoy thanked Mr. Howard for the research on this building and asked why the period of significance ends in 1942 given the additional modifications.

Chair Bartoy moved that the Landmarks Preservation Commission adopt the analysis as findings and schedule the 1117-1119 Pacific Avenue nomination for a public hearing and future consideration at a tentative hearing date of January 25, 2023. Commissioner Hilsendeger seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

6. SPECIAL TAX VALUATION

A. 2104 Commerce

Mr. McKnight read the staff report as provided in the packet.

Mr. Sullivan provided additional comments.

Chair Bartoy moved that the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the Special Tax Valuation application for 2104 Commerce Street for \$739,126.50. Commissioner Morganroth seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

B. Washington Building

Mr. McKnight read the staff report as provided in the packet.

Mr. Howard made additional comments.

Commissioner Hilsendeger expressed appreciation of the renovation and stated that this would be a great location for a future site visit for the Commission. Commissioner Cade echoed Commissioner Hilsendeger's sentiments.

Chair Bartoy moved that the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the Special Tax Valuation application for 1019-1021 Pacific Avenue for \$45,327,559.77. Commissioner Hilsendeger seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

The Landmarks Preservation Commission recessed at 6:24 p.m. and reconvened at 6:30 p.m.

7. DESIGN REVIEW

A. 2804 McCarver (Beals House) *Cladding, windows, HVAC*

Mr. McKnight read the staff report as provided in the packet.

Mr. Naini provided additional comments on the application.

Commissioner Hilsendeger provided feedback regarding the site visit on November 16, 2022.

Commissioner Zeno arrived here at 6:42 p.m.

Chair Bartoy stated that he was happy to hear about the repositioning of the HVAC unit and would like to see spot replacements on the elevations where historic siding is still intact.

Vice-Chair Mortensen agreed with Commissioner Hilsendeger and Chair Bartoy's comments. She also asked if the HardiePlank has similar dimensions to the original wood siding. Mr. McKnight stated that HardiePlank is wider than the original wood siding.

Vice-Chair Mortensen stated that this is a difficult situation in regards to setting a precedent for the Commission and applying the standards as consistently as possible.

Mr. McKnight summarized the Commissioner's comments, stating that the Commission has not expressed concerns on the windows or the deck which may be less of a concern than the siding and HVAC unit and suggested splitting up the motion to approve the windows and deck and either defer or deny the siding and HVAC unit placement.

Ms. Sung asked for clarification regarding the Commissioner's thoughts about the siding.

Mr. Naini noted that spot replacement of the siding would require taking off all the siding above it and finding the right wood would be difficult.

Chair Bartoy moved that the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the portion of the application for 2804 McCarver to include the replacement of the non-historical windows and deck. Commissioner Hilsendeger seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Bartoy moved that the Landmarks Preservation Commission defer the application for 2804 McCarver, regarding the siding and HVAC location pending the applicant provide additional information on siding and plans for the HVAC placement. Commissioner Zeno seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued regarding next steps, clarity on the motion, deferral, and staff review.

The motion passed unanimously.

**B. 1001 Yakima (Tacoma Armory)
Entrance alterations**

Ms. Johnson read the staff report as provided by the packet.

Chair Bartoy asked about the removability of the concrete and if the construction technique is effective and reversible. Mr. McKnight stated that staff will inquire about this with the applicant.

Commissioner Hilsendeger expressed interest in seeing the old wooden doors reused somewhere in the building.

Vice-Chair Mortensen stated that the applicant did not provide enough detail about the level of deterioration of the wooden doors and that the doors do not appear to need to be replaced.

Chair Bartoy asked if the replacement of the wooden doors is due to building code, condition, or both. Ms. Johnson replied that it is in relation to egress code, not ADA.

Ms. Johnson noted that the entrance currently contains a very steep ramp and is not suitable for a pedestrian entrance. She added that this entrance is undergoing interior restoration that will allow this to become the main entrance.

Chair Bartoy agreed with Commissioner Hilsendeger about the wooden door and wants to see the doors reused.

Vice-Chair Mortensen asked if the doors must be replaced for this entrance to be used as the main pedestrian entrance.

Chair Bartoy moved that the Landmarks Preservation Commission approve the application for 1001 South Yakima

Avenue with the following conditions: staff verification of the reversibility of the concrete stairs over existing historic concrete, and a recommendation of reuse of the existing doors. Commissioner Hilsendeger seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

C. 1215 N. 10th Street (NSHD)
Siding, window replacement, skylights

Ms. Johnson read the staff report as provided in the packet.

Commissioner Cade expressed concern regarding developers working on the house without proper permitting and stated that there should be stricter penalties for this.

Chair Bartoy echoed Commissioner Cade's concerns, noted that the changes to the house are not minor, and recommended that the Commission does not approve an application that does not use the historic documentation on file when renovating.

Discussion ensued regarding fees and penalties, the code and enforcement policies, if there is information during the closing of a house about the historic status of a house, the stop work orders on this property, dollar amounts for the fines so far, and concern about the lack of permits.

Commissioner Cade suggested looking into a mechanism that lays out the obligation of new owners in historic districts.

Chair Bartoy noted that many of the changes to the house likely would not have been approved if this proposal had been brought to the Commission earlier.

Commissioner Cade asked about how the Commission's decision will be passed on to the applicant. Mr. McKnight stated that staff can provide feedback to the applicant if needed, and if the permit is denied, reasoning will be attached.

Chair Bartoy moved that the Landmarks Preservation Commission deny the application for 1215 North 10th Street, finding that it does not meet the following Secretary of the Interior's Standards for windows (#1 and #5), siding (#1-4), and porches (#1). Commissioner Zeno seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued regarding leaving out the skylight from the motion because those changes are minimal, noting that skylights have been approved for other houses in the neighborhood and that the staff report goes into detail about each of the points of the guidelines.

The motion passed unanimously.

8. BOARD BUSINESS/COMMUNICATION ITEMS

A. Equity Committee updates

There was no Equity Committee update.

B. Events & Activities

- Tacoma History Quest had a positive reception, with 3 participants successfully completing all 10 clues, and Tacoma Historic Preservation swag prizes have been offered to the winners.

9. CHAIR COMMENTS

Vice-Chair Mortensen mentioned a row of houses on K Street that are being removed for MultiCare construction, noting that Historic Tacoma is advocating to the potential relocation of those homes.

Mr. McKnight noted that Commissioner Williams's and Hart's term on the Commission ends on December 31, 2022, thanked them for their years of service, and noted that Commissioner Hilsendeger was reappointed for another term on the Commission.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:09 p.m.