

Members

Kevin Bartoy, Chair
Jennifer Mortensen, Vice Chair
Jonathan Hart
Sarah Hilsendeger
Alex Morganroth
Lysa Schloesser
Jenny Sullivan
Jeff Williams
George Zeno
Deborah Cade, North Slope Ex-Officio
Leah Jaggars, Wedge Ex-Officio



MINUTES

Landmarks Preservation Commission Planning and Development Services Department

Staff

Reuben McKnight, Historic Preservation Officer
Susan Johnson, Historic Preservation Coordinator
Paige Rooney, Historic Preservation Intern
Mary Crabtree, Administrative Assistant

Date: October 26, 2022

Location: Hybrid – Conference Room 243, 747 Market Street, Tacoma WA 98402 & Zoom Webinar

Commission Members in Attendance:

Kevin Bartoy, Chair
Jonathan Hart
Sarah Hilsendeger
Jenny Sullivan
George Zeno
Deborah Cade, North Slope Ex-Officio
Leah Jaggars, Wedge Ex-Officio

Staff Present:

Reuben McKnight
Susan Johnson
Mary Crabtree
Paige Rooney

Others Present:

Austin Kelley
Doug Naini

Commissioner Members Excused:

Jennifer Mortensen, Vice-Chair
Alex Morganroth
Lysa Schloesser
Jeff Williams

Commission Members Absent:

N/A

Chair Bartoy called the meeting to order at 5:36 p.m.

1. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF INDIGENOUS LANDS

2. ROLL CALL

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

Chair Bartoy reported that there one written comment was received regarding 2804 McCarver.

4. CONSENT AGENDA

The agenda was approved as submitted.

A. Excusal of Absences

- Jennifer Mortensen
- Alex Morganroth
- Lysa Schloesser
- Jeff Williams

B. Approval of Minutes

There were no minutes for approval.

C. Administrative Review

- 915 Pacific – exterior grill replacement
- 808 N. Grant – window replacement

5. DESIGN REVIEW

A. 402 N. Sheridan
Exterior stairs, repainting

Ms. Johnson read the staff report as provided in the packet.

Mr. Kelley provided additional comments.

Commissioner Cade asked if the majority of the house will still be white.

Commissioner Hilsendeger requested clarification on the paint color, suggested adding another color to enhance the detail in the trim, and asked if the only change between the old and new proposal is the addition of blue in the small detail areas.

Commissioner Hart agreed with Commissioner Hilsendeger and noted that the color palette is not much of a change from the previous proposal. He stated that he wants to see more colors to accentuate the trim.

Commissioner Sullivan agreed with Commissioners Hilsendeger and Hart and added that Art Nouveau is influenced by the natural environment and using these colors will keep with the aesthetic as well as accentuate the details.

Commissioner Cade agreed with these comments and reiterated her comment from the prior meeting that this neighborhood contains several houses that look the same, and she does not want to see this unique house look like the others.

Chair Bartoy agreed with the Commissioners and provided additional comments regarding the color choices.

Commissioner Hilsendeger noted appreciation for the stair design and the rendering of the staircase in the photo.

Commissioner Sullivan moved that the Landmarks Preservation Commission defer the application for 402 N. Sheridan Ave., relative to the repainting pending submittal of additional historical data of the palette and approve the application for 402 N. Sheridan Ave. relative to the exterior stairs. Commissioner Zeno seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued regarding if there are plans to paint the masonry.

The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Bartoy provided guidance to the applicant and what to expect when he returns.

6. BOARD BRIEFINGS

A. 2804 McCarver
Siding, windows, rear deck

Ms. Johnson read the staff report as provided in the packet.

Mr. Naini provided additional details regarding the home.

Commissioner Hilsendeger asked what the applicant's plan is regarding the wood door above the addition, if the HVAC on the roof is new, and if there is any guidance regarding the placement of the HVAC unit.

Commissioner Hilsendeger requested that the HVAC unit be moved to the rear because of its visibility. Mr. Naini expressed concern regarding the placement of the HVAC unit lower to the ground.

Chair Bartoy asked if the door above the addition was part of the 1984 renovation of the building.

Chair Bartoy asked if Mr. Naini had any discussions with staff regarding the work that has happened until now and clarified that any changes need to be like-for-like.

Mr. Naini mentioned that he plans to keep the windows and trim the same and plans to use HardiePlank siding.

Chair Bartoy asked if HardiePlank siding is an acceptable replacement for wood siding.

Mr. McKnight stated that spot repair or finding another v-groove siding would be an acceptable choice in this case. The Commission has approved HardiePlank for additions on buildings in the past, and he clarified that he sent Mr. Naini an example of the HardiePlank artisan series v-groove siding that looks like historic drop siding, which could be an option in this case. Mr. Naini expressed concerns about siding costs and the current condition and presence of rat nests behind the siding.

Chair Bartoy explained that the addition of a siding that does not look like the historic material may not be approved by the Commission.

Mr. McKnight provided comments about the Commission approving applications in the past that maintain the current condition rather than return to original standards.

Chair Bartoy stated that the Commission has more flexibility with the 1984 addition.

Commissioner Hilsendeger requested information on the applicant's plan to add a second elevated HVAC unit on the water-facing elevation.

Chair Bartoy asked how much of the siding needs replacement. Mr. Naini explained that all of the siding needs to be replaced due to bubbling and neglect. Chair Bartoy clarified that the replacement of the siding would depend on the condition of the wood rather than the bubbling of the paint and asked if the wood was rotted out.

Commissioner Zeno asked about the siding materials. Mr. Naini stated that the new siding is HardiePlank and the original siding is cedar or Douglas fir.

Commissioner Hilsendeger noted that the Commission does not want the applicant to live with an unhealthy home and requested clarification about the condition of the wood siding and the possibility of reusing the original siding.

Chair Bartoy stated that he does not believe that there needs to be a wholesale replacement of the original siding. He also asked if staff could provide Mr. Naini with some additional resources.

Mr. McKnight spoke about conducting a site visit to see the condition of the siding. He also discussed the cost difference between HardiePlank and wood siding.

Ms. Johnson noted that historic wood siding tends to be of higher quality than newer siding and there might be value gained by refinishing and repainting the original siding if Mr. Naini can add insulation.

Chair Bartoy suggested that the Commission conduct a site visit.

Mr. Naini asked if he could do a wholesale replacement of the siding if he chose a v-groove siding like Mr. McKnight suggested. Commissioner Zeno expressed concern about sustainability and waste regarding the wholesale replacement of the wood siding if it is still functioning properly. Chair Bartoy stated that he has not seen the Commission approve a wholesale replacement of siding, and requested that Mr. Naini provide proof to the Commission of whether the siding is original to the house or not.

Mr. McKnight summarized the Commission's concerns regarding the siding, and suggested a site visit to inspect the condition of the siding.

Chair Bartoy reiterated Mr. McKnight's summary, stating that the first question is the condition of the siding, then if the siding needs to be replaced in some areas, the question becomes how the siding should be replaced.

7. BOARD BUSINESS/COMMUNICATION ITEMS

A. Equity Committee updates

There was no Equity Committee update.

B. Events & Activities

- Tacoma Noir, a virtual, fictional mystery based on actual Tacoma history, is going on now. Listeners can try to solve the mystery and enter for a chance to win small prizes. More information at Pretty Gritty Tours and on Tacoma Culture social media accounts.
- Tacoma History Quest will be going on during the month of November. Coming soon to social media.
- A presentation “Uncovering Hidden Stories” by the Tacoma Public Library and Northwest Room staff will be held on November 10, 2022, at noon.

8. CHAIR COMMENTS

Several Commissioners provided comments about potentially adding the historic status of homes to the deed.

Commissioner Zeno asked how the city’s drive for zero-waste overlays with historic preservation. Mr. McKnight provided comments and suggested someone from the city’s green building program speak to the Commission.

Commissioner Zeno added that the tribes are going after local and state policies around development and that there may be more inquiry into development and recycling and reuse of materials.

Discussion ensued regarding sustainability, including how this would filter down to local governments, concerns of the waterways and landfills, having someone from the City discuss sustainability with the Commission, demolition conflicting with sustainability goals, having salvage requirements, giving knowledge of resources and the Commission’s expectations, and getting an overview of the circular economy framework that the City uses.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:56 p.m.